## Sharp discrete isoperimetric inequalities in periodic graphs via discrete PDE and Semidiscrete Optimal Transport

Mircea Petrache, PUC Chile
(joint work in 2020 with Matias Gómez, who is now at Imperial College)


January 8, 2024
$N \mathrm{~N}: \stackrel{0}{0}$

## CRystal structures and cluster shapes

Example: $\min _{\left\{x_{1}, \ldots, x_{N}\right\}} \sum_{i \neq j} V\left(\left|x_{i}-x_{j}\right|\right)$, Lennard-Jones $V(r)=\frac{1}{r^{12}}-\frac{1}{r^{6^{6}}}$.
Numerics:


Local structure: triangular lattice. Global shape: hexagon.

Tóth 1956, Heitmann-Radin 1980: sticky disk model. Schmidt 2013: fluctuations around hexagon. Theil 2006: triangular lattice crystallization

Bétermin-De Luca-Petrache 2019: crystal can be $\mathbb{Z}^{2}$ for soft sticky disc model (robust in $V$, limit $N \rightarrow \infty$ ). Octagon shape.

## What other shapes？For Which bond graphs？




## ISOPERIMETRIC INEQUALITIES

Find $H \subset \mathbb{R}^{d}$ such that: $\quad \frac{\operatorname{Area}(\partial H)^{d}}{\operatorname{Vol}(H)^{d-1}}=\min _{\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^{d}} \frac{\operatorname{Area}(\partial \Omega)^{d}}{\operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)^{d-1}}$

- (Find best $C_{H}>0$ such that $\operatorname{Area}(\partial \Omega)^{d} \leq C_{H} \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)^{d-1}$.)
- Extended notion of "area", depending on norm $g$ on normal vectors:

$$
\operatorname{Area}_{g}(\Omega):=\int_{\partial \Omega} g(\nu(x)) d S(x)
$$

## Theorem (Wulff 1901)

For Vol as usual and Area $_{g}$ as above, optimizer is

$$
H=\left\{x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}: \forall \nu, x \cdot \nu<g(\nu)\right\},
$$

up to dilation/rotation.

## DISCRETE SHARP ISOPERIMETRIC INEQUALITY

## Setup:

- $V \subset \mathbb{R}^{d}$ discrete set (allowed atom positions).
- $G=(V, E)$ undirected graph (bond graph).
- $g: E \rightarrow[0,+\infty)$ weight (boundary bond energies).

Looking for edge-isoperimetric inequalities of the form
$\forall \Omega \subset V$ finite $, \quad(\sharp \Omega)^{d-1} \leq C\left(\not \sharp_{g} \partial \Omega\right)^{d}:=C\left(\sum_{(x, y) \in \vec{\partial} \vec{\Omega}} g(x, y)\right)^{d}$.

- "Sharp inequality": Equality actually achieved for some $\Omega \subset V$.
- "Interesting case": Equality achieved for $\infty$-many values of $\sharp \Omega$.


## CONTINUUM ISOPERIMETRIC PROOF - $1 / 3$

## Strategy 1: PDE + convexity

(Cabré-Ros Oton-Serra 2013, Trudinger 1994)

$$
\begin{cases}\Delta u(x)=\frac{\operatorname{Area}_{8}(\Omega)}{\operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)} & x \in \Omega, \\ \frac{\partial u}{\partial \nu}(x)=g(\nu(x)) & x \in \partial \Omega .\end{cases}
$$

Solution exists, is regular and unique up to constant summand.

$$
\Gamma_{u}:=\{x \in \Omega: u(y) \geq u(x)+\nabla u(x) \cdot(y-x) \quad y \in \bar{\Omega}\} .
$$

(set of $x$ such that tg. plane to $\operatorname{graph}\left(\left.u\right|_{\Omega}\right)$ at $x$ supports graph $\left(\left.u\right|_{\Omega}\right)$.)

## CONTINUUM PROOFS - $2 / 3$

Claim: $H \subset \nabla u\left(\Gamma_{u}\right)$.

- $p \in H \stackrel{\text { def.) }}{\Leftrightarrow} p \cdot \nu<g(\nu)$ whenever $|\nu|=1$.
- Let $x \in \bar{\Omega}$ minimum of $u(y)-p \cdot y$.
- If $x \in \partial \Omega$ then $\frac{\partial(u(y)-p \cdot y)}{\partial \nu} \leq 0$..
..that is, $\frac{\partial u}{\partial \nu}(x) \leq p \cdot \nu$. Contradiction!
- So $x$ is interior. It follows:
- $p=\nabla u(x)$ (critical point),
- $u(y) \geq u(x)+p \cdot(y-x), \forall y \in \bar{\Omega}$

Therefore $p \in \nabla u\left(\Gamma_{u}\right)$, proving the claim.

We get

$$
\operatorname{Vol}(H) \leq \operatorname{Vol}\left(\nabla u\left(\Gamma_{u}\right)\right)=\int_{\nabla u\left(\Gamma_{u}\right)} d p \leq \int_{\Gamma_{u}} \operatorname{det}\left[D^{2} u(x)\right] d x
$$

## CONTINUUM PROOFS - $3 / 3$

Linear algebra: $\lambda_{1} \leq \lambda_{2} \leq \cdots \leq \lambda_{d}$ eigenvalues of $D^{2} u(x)$, then

$$
\operatorname{det}\left[D^{2} u(x)\right]=\prod_{j=1}^{d} \lambda_{j} \leq\left(\frac{1}{d} \sum_{j=1}^{d} \lambda_{j}\right)^{d}=\left(\frac{\operatorname{tr}\left[D^{2} u(x)\right]}{d}\right)^{d}=\left(\frac{\Delta u(x)}{d}\right)^{d} .
$$

We get $\operatorname{Vol}(H) \leq \operatorname{Vol}\left(\Gamma_{u}\right)\left(\frac{\Delta u(x)}{d}\right)^{d}$, and then we have:

$$
\operatorname{Vol}\left(\Gamma_{u}\right) \leq \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega), \quad\left(\frac{\Delta u(x)}{d}\right)^{d}=\left(\frac{\operatorname{Area}_{g}(\Omega)}{d \cdot \operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)}\right)^{d}
$$

We get

$$
d^{d} \operatorname{Vol}(H) \leq \frac{\operatorname{Area}_{g}(\Omega)^{d}}{\operatorname{Vol}(\Omega)^{d-1}}
$$

Use that $g(\nu(x))=x \cdot \nu(x)$ on $\partial H$ and divergence theorem:
$\operatorname{Area}_{g}(H)=\int_{\partial H} g(\nu(x)) d S \stackrel{*}{=} \int_{\partial H} x \cdot \nu(x) d S=\int_{H} \operatorname{div}(x) d x=d \operatorname{Vol}(H)$.

## The Discrete result

- Auxiliary laplacian: $\Delta u(x):=\sum_{y:\{x, y\} \in E}(u(x)-u(y))$.
- Solve discrete PDI (discrete PDE not solvable in general)

$$
\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\Delta u(x) \leq \frac{\sharp_{8} \vec{\partial} \vec{\Omega}}{\sharp \Omega} \quad \text { for } x \in \Omega \\
u(y)-u(x)=g(x, y) \quad \text { for }(x, y) \in \overrightarrow{\partial \Omega} .
\end{array}\right.
$$

- Subdifferential, proximal subdifferential, dual (Wulff) shape:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\partial u(x) & :=\left\{p \in \mathbb{R}^{d}:(\forall z \in \bar{\Omega}), u(x) \leq u(z)+p \cdot(x-z)\right\}, \\
\partial^{\operatorname{prox}} u(x) & :=\left\{p \in \mathbb{R}^{d}:(\forall z:\{x, z\} \in E), u(x) \leq u(z)+p \cdot(x-z)\right\}, \\
H_{g} & :=\left\{p \in \mathbb{R}^{d}:(\forall(x, y) \in \overrightarrow{\partial \Omega}), p \cdot(y-x) \leq g(x, y)\right\} .
\end{aligned}
$$

## The discrete result (Gomez-Petrache, arXiv)

$\operatorname{Vol}\left(H_{g}\right) \stackrel{(a)}{\leq} \operatorname{Vol}\left(\bigcup_{x \in \Omega} \partial u(x)\right) \stackrel{(b)}{=} \sum_{x \in \Omega} \operatorname{Vol}(\partial u(x)) \stackrel{(c)}{\leq} \sum_{x \in \Omega} \operatorname{Vol}\left(\partial^{\text {prox }} u(x)\right)$

$$
\stackrel{(d)}{\leq} \sum_{x \in \Omega} c_{x}\left(\Delta_{A} u(x)\right)^{d} \stackrel{(e)}{\leq}\left(\max _{x \in \Omega} c_{x}\right) \frac{\left(\not \sharp_{g} \overrightarrow{\partial \Omega}\right)^{d}}{(\sharp \Omega)^{d-1}} .
$$

Crucial: "Minkowski" arithmetic-geometric inequality

$$
\begin{aligned}
\qquad c_{x}:= & \max \left\{\operatorname{Vol}\left(\bigcap_{v \in \mathcal{V}} H_{v}\left(c_{v}\right)\right): \sum_{v \in \mathcal{V}} c_{v}=1\right\}, \\
\text { where } \quad & \left\{\begin{array}{l}
\mathcal{V}=\{y-x:\{x, y\} \in E\}, \\
c_{v}=\frac{u(y)-u(x)}{\Delta u(x)} .
\end{array}\right.
\end{aligned}
$$

Then we get: $\quad \operatorname{Vol}\left(\partial^{\text {prox }} u(x)\right) \leq c_{x}(\Delta u(x))^{d}$.
We can add weights: $\Delta_{W} u(x):=\sum_{y \sim x} W(x, y)(u(y)-u(x))$.

## THEOREM:

Necessary conditions on $u, W, \Omega$ for equality:

- (Minkowski constants) $\left(c_{x}\right)_{x \in \Omega}$ all equal,
- (Subdifferential tiling) $\partial^{\operatorname{prox}} u(x), x \in \Omega$ equal volume partition of $\partial u(\Omega)$,
- (Bond graph shape) $\left.G\right|_{\bar{\Omega}}$ reciprocal to the above partition,
- (Convexity of $\Omega$ ) Our PDI achieves equality.

Sufficient conditions on $G, \Omega$ for equality. (assume $\Omega \subset V$ connected in $G$ ).

- The complex made of vertices and edges of $\left.G\right|_{\Omega} \cup \overrightarrow{\partial \Omega}$ is reciprocal to the collection of $d$ - and $(d-1)$-cells of an equal-volume Voronoi tessellation of a convex polyhedron $H$.
- $\exists W: E \rightarrow(0,+\infty)$ symmetric weight, such that $\frac{W^{2}(x, y)|y-x|}{\operatorname{Area}\left(F_{x, y}\right)}$ takes the same value for all edges $\{x, y\} \in E$, where $F_{x, y}=$ facet dual to $\{x, y\}$.


## Link to optimal transport (Aleksandrov solutions):

- $u$ achieves equality $\Leftrightarrow u=\lambda u_{\text {Alek }}+\ell$ for some $\lambda>0, \ell: \mathbb{R}^{d} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ affine, and $\partial u_{\text {Alek }}=\left[\right.$ Opt. Transp. of $\frac{\sum_{x \in \Omega} \delta_{x}}{\sharp \Omega}$ to $\frac{\left.\mathcal{L}^{d}\right|_{H}}{\operatorname{Vol}(H)}$, under cost $\left.|x-y|^{2}\right]$.


## EXAMPLES:

- Hexagons in Honeycomb graph, and deformations.

- Rhombic dodecahedra for skeleton of BCC.



## THEOREM (CONSTRUCTION OF EXAMPLES):

- (tiling) Assume that we have an equal-volume tiling of $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ by convex sets.
- (alignment) The tiling is obtained by cutting $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ by hyperplanes.
- (reciprocal graph) Take the graph $G=(V, E)$ that is reciprocal to that tiling.
- Then we can find weight $W: E \rightarrow(0,+\infty)$ such that for an infinite family of $\Omega$ 's in $G$ the previous criterion shows that they are isoperimetric shapes.
(Examples: Coxeter hyperplane arrangements.)


## PAST RESULTS, UNEXPLORED DIRECTIONS:

- Hamamuki 2014: $\mathbb{Z}^{d}$ product graph with nearest-neighbor edges, constant $g$ (cubes optimize).
- Gomez-Petrache 2020 sample applications:
- Honeycomb graph - hexagons optimize.
- The triangular lattice (with $g=1$ ) does not have a sharp inequality as above, the sharp inequality is:

$$
\frac{(\sharp \overrightarrow{\partial \Omega}-6)^{2}}{4 \sharp \Omega-\sharp \overrightarrow{\partial \Omega}+2} \geq 12,
$$

optimized only by "perfect hexagons" (follows by duality with honeycomb graph).

## IF you Want To Think about the problem:

- Aurenhammer 1987, Rybnikov 1999: translation between liftings, weighted Voronoi tessellations, reciprocal graphs.
- Mérigot 2013, Benamou-Froese 2017: link of the above to semidiscrete optimal transport.
- Trudinger 1994: further continuum isoperimetric inequalities (higher order operators / quermassintegrals).
- Isoperimetric constant in graphs: link to new(?) discrete laplacians in Gomez-Petrache 2020, general Cheeger type bounds to be explored.
- Exotic forms of optimal inequalites in periodic graphs do exist Continuum limit gives just leading order behavior $(\sharp \Omega)^{d-1} \leq C\left(\sharp_{g} \partial \Omega\right)^{d}$.
Mystery: algebra behind the triangle graph case!

